

POLICE OFFICER RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

Police Officer Recruitment Cost Analysis

Megan Cheng

California State University, Long Beach

PSY688: Practicum in I/O Psychology

Christopher R. Warren, Ph.D.

May 16, 2024

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

Project Summary

This practicum project at the [REDACTED] Personnel Department involved a comprehensive cost analysis of the police officer recruitment process. Previous efforts had focused on "time-to-hire," but there was a critical need for a detailed "cost-to-hire" analysis to enhance transparency and inform decision-making. The project entailed adapting data collection methods, designing specific questionnaires, and managing detailed documentation while ensuring confidentiality and data integrity. The findings provided valuable insights into the resource allocation and potential areas for cost optimization. This experience not only sharpened analytical skills but also highlighted the importance of strategic data management. The results will support strategic adjustments in recruitment policies, contributing to a more resilient and responsive police force. The outcomes are intended to streamline the recruitment process, ensuring efficiency and sustainability.

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

Police Officer Recruitment Cost Analysis

Organizational Context

The [REDACTED] Personnel Department is a key component of the city's administrative framework, with over 600 employees working across [REDACTED] divisions to support the employment needs of the city's workforce. Within this structure, the Public Safety Division plays a crucial role in recruiting for public safety positions, including Police Officers, Firefighters, and Airport Police, ensuring that the city's safety and security needs are adequately met.

The recruitment process for police officers is extensive and includes steps such as application, multiple-choice tests, background investigations, personal history statements, fingerprinting, background interviews, polygraph exams, departmental interviews, physical fitness qualifiers, medical evaluations, field investigations, and psychological evaluations. Although the department has previously focused on "time-to-hire" studies, there was a recognized need for a "cost-to-hire" analysis to enhance the transparency and efficiency of the recruitment process, ultimately leading to more sustainable hiring practices.

Driven by the city's safety requirements and [REDACTED] goal to increase the [REDACTED] force to 9,500 officers, this project aimed to address the urgent need for an optimized and sustainable recruitment strategy through a detailed cost analysis.

Organizational Problem & Proposed Solution

Organizational Problem

The recruitment process for police officers at the [REDACTED] Personnel Department is facing substantial challenges due to the ambitious goal set by [REDACTED] to increase the [REDACTED] force to 9,500 officers. This goal is driven by the need to enhance public safety, yet the department struggles with high attrition rates among seasoned officers and a

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

societal trend of increasingly negative perceptions towards police officers since 2020. These factors have made it difficult to attract and retain qualified candidates, further complicating the recruitment process. Additionally, the lack of a comprehensive cost analysis has limited the department's ability to allocate resources effectively and manage the recruitment budget.

Proposed Solution

The proposed solution was to implement a comprehensive "cost-to-hire" analysis. This project aimed to fill the existing gap by evaluating the financial implications of each step in the recruitment process. By systematically collecting and analyzing cost data, the project intended to identify inefficiencies and areas for cost optimization. The findings would provide actionable insights, enabling the department to make informed decisions and improve the sustainability of the recruitment process. This approach was designed to align the recruitment strategy with the city's goal of enhancing public safety through an expanded police force.

Steps in Project Completion

Initial Planning and Data Collection

The project commenced with a detailed planning phase, involving consultations with my Supervisor and the Division Chief. It was determined that stakeholder interviews would be replaced with a more flexible approach using Google Docs. This method was chosen to accommodate the busy schedules of the division chiefs responsible for maintaining the smooth functioning of their respective divisions.

The data collection process targeted five division chiefs and the Assistant General Manager of the Personnel Department. Six documents were crafted (see Appendices A-F), each containing specific questions tailored to different steps of the recruitment process. These

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

questions covered key aspects such as the number of staff involved in each step, the number of hours each staff member devoted to their tasks, and the job classifications of these individuals.

After developing these documents, the Division Chief contacted the targeted individuals in advance to ensure their willingness to participate in the project. Following the review and approval of the documents, they were distributed via email to the respective division chiefs. This approach ensured that data collection was both comprehensive and efficient, while also respecting the participants' time and responsibilities.

Data Analysis and Interpretation

The data analysis phase began with the compilation of completed questionnaires from the division chiefs (see Appendices A-F). Where data gaps existed, additional outreach was conducted to ensure completeness. The collected data was standardized by converting diverse metrics into hours per candidate for each recruitment step.

Verification of job classifications and pay grades was conducted for all involved positions. Annual salaries were converted to hourly rates based on a typical work year of 2080 hours. These standardized rates were then used to convert labor hours worked by each staff member into cost per candidate. Both direct and indirect costs per candidate were calculated by integrating the pay grades with the hours contributed by each staff member. It was determined necessary to create a minimum and maximum range for the individual salaries per job classification, which were carried into the formatting for the final cost-per-candidate results, subtotaled by division in addition to a grand total.

This comprehensive cost analysis provided valuable insights into the distribution of costs across the recruitment process, identifying high-cost stages and areas where resource utilization

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

could be optimized. The results of this analysis formed the basis for practical recommendations aimed at improving the efficiency and sustainability of the recruitment process.

Challenges & Facilitators

The project encountered several challenges, primarily due to competing work demands that disrupted the timeline by about two weeks. The intensive interview stage for another exam required full attention and significantly impacted the project's progress. Additionally, the in-person role limitations constrained the ability to work on the project outside of office hours, as essential files and tools were not accessible remotely.

The data compilation process was also delayed due to missing information in the questionnaires. This issue was exacerbated when a key Division Chief, who was essential for providing the missing data, went on vacation, further postponing the analysis phase.

Several key facilitators contributed to the project's success. Consultative assistance from a senior financial manager, the project lead's father, was instrumental in addressing the financial analysis challenges. The cost analysis required innovative approaches due to the limited and inter-divisional nature of the data gathered. Online templates for cost analyses were either too process-heavy or required more background experience and data than was available. This expertise helped in setting up cost analysis models and Excel formulas, optimizing the data that was available.

Advanced communication strategies were also crucial. The Division Chief [REDACTED] [REDACTED] advance communication with the division chiefs and the [REDACTED] primed them to expect the project's email and ensured their willingness to help. This was especially important given the project lead's status as an intern, which inherently carried less

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

influence. The Division Chief's credibility and standing lent significant weight to the project, ensuring timely and comprehensive responses from the contacted individuals.

Results

The comprehensive cost analysis of the police officer recruitment process revealed significant insights into the distribution of costs across various recruitment stages. Each stage of the recruitment process was evaluated in terms of the hours devoted by staff and the associated costs. The analysis accounted for the variance in pay-steps per job classification, resulting in minimum and maximum cost ranges.

Subtotal Costs by Division

- [REDACTED]
 - Total Cost: \$35.79 - \$52.32
- [REDACTED]
 - Total Cost: \$3,456.40 - \$4,822.33
- [REDACTED]:
 - Total Cost: \$2,202.23 - \$3,059.89
- [REDACTED]
 - Total Cost: \$283.10 - \$400.47
- [REDACTED]
 - Total Cost: \$17,589.18 - \$23,071.58
- [REDACTED]
 - Total Cost: \$2,178.04 - \$3,185.42

Total Costs per Candidate

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

The total cost per candidate, reflecting the combined direct and indirect costs, ranged from \$25,744.74 to \$34,592.01. These ranges were necessary due to variations in pay-steps associated with different job classifications.

This holistic view of the recruitment process highlighted areas where resource utilization could be optimized, providing a foundation for actionable recommendations. The analysis identified several high-cost stages, including the Field Investigation and Polygraph Exam stages. For example, the Field Investigation stage involved extensive hours from Background Investigators, resulting in substantial costs. Similarly, the Polygraph Exam stage required specialized personnel, contributing to higher costs.

These insights underscore the importance of optimizing resource allocation and highlight specific stages where cost-saving measures could be implemented. The results of this analysis formed the basis for practical recommendations aimed at improving the efficiency and sustainability of the recruitment process.

Discussion

Interpretation of Results

The cost analysis provided detailed insights into the financial demands of the police officer recruitment process. The most significant cost was associated with the [REDACTED], where costs ranged from \$17,589.18 to \$23,071.58. This high cost was primarily due to the Field Investigation stage conducted by [REDACTED], who takes an average of [REDACTED] to complete an in-depth field investigation, often taking the staff outside the workplace.

Significant costs were also observed in the [REDACTED] with totals between \$3,456.40 and \$4,822.33. The labor-intensive background checks were a

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

primary cost driver in this division. The [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] [REDACTED] also incurred notable costs. The [REDACTED] incurred costs between \$2,202.23 and \$3,059.89, attributed to the medical evaluations necessary for candidate clearance. The [REDACTED] had costs ranging from \$2,178.04 to \$3,185.42, reflecting the specialized technical assessments conducted during recruitment.

In total, the cost per candidate ranged from \$25,744.74 to \$34,592.01, encompassing both direct and indirect costs. These cost ranges were necessary due to the variability in pay-steps for different job classifications. A visual analysis was performed to identify the most expensive stages and areas where expenses were easily identified. This analysis revealed that certain stages, such as the Field Investigation, were particularly costly due to the extensive time and specialized personnel required. Additionally, the data showed areas where the number of administrative staff involved became redundant for the tasks at hand, potentially implying the need for more streamlined processes to reduce any excess involvement.

These insights highlight the need for strategic resource allocation and the potential for cost optimization in high-expense stages of the recruitment process. By understanding where the highest costs are incurred and identifying redundancies, the Personnel Department can implement strategies to optimize these stages, potentially reducing overall costs and improving efficiency. For instance, streamlining the Field Investigation process or utilizing lower-cost personnel for initial screenings could yield substantial savings. Furthermore, reassessing the necessity of multiple administrative staff for similar steps could eliminate redundancy and enhance operational efficiency.

Solution Suggestions

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

Based on the insights from the cost analysis, three actionable solutions have been identified to optimize the police officer recruitment process.

Optimize Field Investigation Resources: The current issue involves high resource utilization, with one [REDACTED] dedicating [REDACTED] to a single candidate. To address this, a blended approach can be implemented by integrating lower pay-grade officers for preliminary tasks and reserving higher pay-grade officers for complex aspects of the investigation. This strategy reduces hourly costs and allows high-grade officers to focus on critical components of the investigation. A cost-benefit analysis using a dummy sheet can model different scenarios to assess the cost impacts of various combinations of lower and higher pay-grade officers completing tasks.

Enhanced Training for Administrative Tasks: Administrative tasks across various steps, especially in the [REDACTED]) and the [REDACTED] [REDACTED] are currently handled by multiple individuals. Developing a specialized training program for existing staff to handle multiple administrative tasks efficiently can reduce the dependency on multiple individuals. This approach will streamline administrative functions and improve operational efficiency. A cost-benefit analysis should evaluate the reduction in personnel needed against the cost of developing and delivering the training program.

Cross-Training of Existing Personnel: Specific tasks within recruitment steps are siloed among specialized personnel. Implementing cross-training programs will enable personnel to handle multiple aspects of the recruitment process, increasing workforce flexibility and reducing bottlenecks. By having a more versatile workforce, the department can improve efficiency and mitigate delays caused by personnel unavailability. A cost-benefit analysis should analyze the training costs against the efficiency gains from having a more adaptable workforce.

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

Skill Takeaways

This project has provided numerous valuable lessons and skills that will be beneficial in future endeavors:

1. **Improved Analytical and Technical Skills:** Conducting the cost analysis significantly enhanced my ability to work with large datasets, perform cost-benefit analyses, and utilize Excel for financial modeling and automation. These technical skills are critical for effectively managing and analyzing complex data sets in any professional setting.
2. **Enhanced Project Management Abilities:** Balancing multiple tasks and deadlines while managing other work demands improved my project management skills, including time management and task prioritization. Staying organized under pressure and adapting to changing circumstances were crucial lessons that will be valuable in future projects and roles.
3. **Strategic Thinking and Problem-Solving:** Identifying high-cost stages and redundancies in the recruitment process required strategic thinking and problem-solving. Analyzing data, understanding underlying issues, and proposing actionable solutions demonstrated a strong aptitude for strategic planning and operational efficiency. These skills will enable me to approach future challenges with a strategic mindset, focusing on efficiency and sustainability.
4. **Adaptability and Flexibility:** Adapting the data collection method due to stakeholder availability and handling time-sensitive work duties for another exam highlighted the importance of flexibility. Finding alternative solutions and adapting to changing circumstances were crucial for project completion. This experience has reinforced the value of being adaptable in dynamic environments.

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

Conclusion

The comprehensive cost analysis of the police officer recruitment process has not only provided valuable insights into the financial implications of various recruitment stages, but also highlighted areas for potential optimization. By implementing the proposed solutions, the [REDACTED] Personnel Department, [REDACTED], can enhance the efficiency and sustainability of its recruitment process. The lessons learned and skills gained from this project will be instrumental in future endeavors, contributing to more effective project management, strategic planning, and operational efficiency.

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

References

████████████████████ Department. (n.d.). Personnel Department. Retrieved from

<https://personnel████████.gov/index.html>

City Administrative Officer, ████████████████████. (n.d.). *Memoranda of understanding*.

Retrieved from <https://████████.gov/mous/>.

████████ Recruitment. (n.d.). *Join ██████████*. Retrieved from <https://www.join████████.com>

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

Appendix A: Data Collection Questionnaire – [REDACTED]

Introduction

This appendix includes the questions presented to the [REDACTED]
[REDACTED], regarding the Police Officer hiring process.

Questionnaire:

IMPORTANT: Please note that the following question(s) do not pertain to inquiries regarding supplies, licenses, or materials.

MANAGERIAL

- 1) On average, how many hours do you spend on PO hiring?
 - a) Please include any and all hours spent in meetings or performing other duties related to the Police Officer hiring process.

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

Appendix B: Data Collection Questionnaire - [REDACTED]

Introduction

This appendix includes the questions presented to the [REDACTED], led by [REDACTED], regarding the various steps in the recruitment process.

Questionnaire:

IMPORTANT: Please note that the following questions do not pertain to inquiries regarding supplies, licenses, or materials.

STEP 3: PERSONAL HISTORY STATEMENT (FINGERPRINTING, BI INTERVIEW)

- 1) On average, how many [REDACTED] employees does it take to review one Personal History Statement (PHS)?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of those employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please provide the average number of hours spent total reviewing one PHS.

STEP 4: DEPARTMENT INTERVIEW, POLYGRAPH EXAMINATION, PHYSICAL FITNESS

QUALIFICATION (PFQ)

- 1) On average, how many [REDACTED] employees does it take to conduct fingerprinting (e.g., scheduling, administering, e-communication)?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of those employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please provide the average number of hours spent total reviewing one PHS.

- 2) On average, how many [REDACTED] employees does it take to review one Polygraph Examination?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of those employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

- b) Please provide the average number of hours spent total reviewing one Polygraph Examination.

STEP 6: FIELD INVESTIGATION

- 1) On average, how many [REDACTED] employees does it take to complete a Field Investigation for one candidate.
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of all involved employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please provide the average number of hours each involved employee worked per Field Investigation.

STEP: APPEALS

- 1) On average, how many [REDACTED] employees does it take to complete a [REDACTED] appeal process for one candidate.
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of all involved employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please provide the average number of hours each involved employee worked per appeal.

MANAGERIAL

- 1) How many managerial employees spend time working on PO?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of all involved employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) On average, how many hours do these employees spend working on PO, which are not accounted for in the preceding questions?

Appendix C: Data Collection Questionnaire - [REDACTED]

Introduction

This appendix includes the questions presented to the [REDACTED] led by [REDACTED], regarding the medical and psychological evaluation steps.

Questionnaire:

IMPORTANT: Please note that the following questions do not pertain to inquiries regarding supplies, licenses, or materials.

STEP 5: MEDICAL EVALUATION

- 1) On average, how many [REDACTED] employees does it take to complete a Medical Evaluation for one candidate.
 - a) Please provide the job classifications of all involved employees (e.g. doctors, administrative staff, etc.), and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please provide the average number of hours each involved employee worked per Medical Evaluation (e.g. meeting with the candidate, processing paperwork before/after each appointment, etc.). Total Average time to process a police candidate:

STEP 7: PSYCHOLOGICAL EVALUATION

- 1) On average, how many [REDACTED] employees does it take to complete a Psychological Evaluation for one candidate?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications of all involved employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please provide the average number of hours each involved employee worked per Psychological Evaluation.

STEP: APPEALS

- 1) On average, how many [REDACTED] employees does it take to complete a Psychological appeal process for one candidate.

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

- a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of all involved employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
- b) Please provide the average number of hours each involved employee worked per appeal.

MANAGERIAL

- 1) How many managerial employees spend time working on PO?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of all involved employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) On average, how many hours do these employees spend working on PO, which are not accounted for in the preceding questions?

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

Appendix D: Data Collection Questionnaire – [REDACTED]

Introduction

This appendix includes the questions presented to the [REDACTED] led by [REDACTED], concerning recruitment and administrative tasks.

Questionnaire:

IMPORTANT: Please note that the following question(s) do not pertain to inquiries regarding supplies, licenses, or materials.

RECRUITMENT

- 1) What is the total dollar amount of the recruitment budget for the last fiscal year (2022-2023)?
- 2) How many employees work in recruitment for Police Officer selection?
 - a) Please specify the job classifications of those employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please specify the average number of hours worked per month for each employee.

STEP 2: MULTIPLE CHOICE (MC) TEST

- 1) How many candidates took the online Multiple Choice test in the last fiscal year?
- 2) In the last fiscal year, what is the average number of on-site Multiple Choice tests administered, which were proctored by the [REDACTED] ?
 - a) Please provide the average number of proctors per event.
 - b) Please provide the average number of test-taking candidates per event.
- 3) How many on-site Multiple Choice tests, proctored by [REDACTED] were administered per month in the last fiscal year?
 - 4) How many on-site Multiple Choice tests, proctored by [REDACTED] were administered per recruiting event in the last fiscal year?

** Additional costs:

- 3) How many employees work in Police Officer selection, excluding recruitment?

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

- a) Please specify the job classifications of those employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.

STEP 4: DEPARTMENT INTERVIEW, POLYGRAPH EXAMINATION, PHYSICAL FITNESS

QUALIFICATION (PFQ)

- 1) What is the average number of Interview Specialists used for the Department Interviews each month in the last fiscal year?
 - a) Please specify the number of hours an Interview Specialist spent per day in Department Interviews.
 - b) What is the average number of sworn raters used for the Department Interviews each month in the last fiscal year?
 - a) Please specify the number of hours sworn raters spent per day in Department Interviews.
- 2) What is the average number of all employees who were involved in scheduling the Polygraph Examination for one candidate?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications of all involved employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please provide the average number of hours each involved employee worked per Medical Evaluation.

STEP 5: MEDICAL EVALUATION

- 1) What is the average number of all employees who were involved in scheduling the Medical Evaluation for one candidate in the last fiscal year?
 - c) Please provide the job classifications of all involved employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - d) Please provide the average number of hours each involved employee worked per Medical Evaluation.

MANAGERIAL

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

- 1) How many managerial employees spend time working on PO?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of all involved employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) On average, how many hours do these employees spend working on PO, which are not accounted for in the preceding questions?

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

Appendix E: Data Collection Questionnaire – [REDACTED]

Introduction

This appendix includes the questions presented to the [REDACTED] [REDACTED], led by [REDACTED], detailing various aspects of the recruitment process.

Questionnaire:

IMPORTANT: Please note that the following question(s) do not pertain to inquiries regarding supplies, licenses, or materials.

RECRUITMENT

- 1) What is the total dollar amount of recruitment funds spent by [REDACTED] in the last fiscal year (2022-2023)?
- 2) What is the current total number of employees who have acted as mentors/advisors to applicants for Police Officer recruiting?
 - a) Please specify the job classifications and pay grade of those employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please specify the average number of hours worked per week in Police Officer hiring.
- 3) What is the average number of employees working at different recruitment events in the last fiscal year?
 - a) Please provide the average number of events per quarter (with or without testing being offered).
 - b) Please specify the employees' job classifications and pay grades, and the number of employees in each job classification per event.
 - c) Please specify the average number of hours worked per event.

STEP 3: PERSONAL HISTORY STATEMENT

- 1) How many [REDACTED] employees does it take to review one Personal History Statement (PHS)?

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

- a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of those employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
- b) Please provide the average number of hours spent total reviewing one PHS.

STEP 4: DEPARTMENT INTERVIEW, POLYGRAPH EXAMINATION, PHYSICAL FITNESS

QUALIFICATION (PFQ)

- 1) How many ■■■ employees does it take to review one Polygraph Examination?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of those employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please provide the average number of hours spent total reviewing one Polygraph Examination.

STEP 6: FIELD INVESTIGATION

- 1) How many ■■■ employees does it take to review one Background Investigation?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of those employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please provide the average number of hours spent total reviewing one Polygraph Examination.

MANAGERIAL

- 1) How many managerial employees spend time working on PO?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of all involved employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) On average, how many hours do these employees spend working on PO, which are not accounted for in the preceding questions?

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

Appendix F: Data Collection Questionnaire – [REDACTED]

Introduction

This appendix includes the questions and responses collected from the [REDACTED], led by [REDACTED], focusing on technical assessments like polygraph examinations.

Questionnaire:

IMPORTANT: Please note that the following question(s) do not pertain to inquiries regarding supplies, licenses, or materials.

STEP 4: DEPARTMENT INTERVIEW, POLYGRAPH EXAMINATION, PHYSICAL FITNESS

QUALIFICATION (PFQ)

- 1) On average, how many [REDACTED] employees are involved in processing the Polygraph Test (e.g., scheduling, entering results, etc.) for one candidate?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of those employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please provide the average number of hours each involved employee worked per week processing Polygraph tests.
- 2) What is the average number of all employees involved in processing Polygraph test appeals per month?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications of those employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.
 - b) Please provide the average number of hours each involved employee worked per week processing Polygraph tests.

MANAGERIAL

- 1) How many managerial employees spend time working on PO?
 - a) Please provide the job classifications and pay grades of all involved employees, and the number of employees in each job classification.

PO RECRUITMENT COST ANALYSIS

- b) On average, how many hours do these employees spend working on PO, which are not accounted for in the preceding questions?